

**Post-Election Audit
of the
August 14, 2018
Partisan Primary**

August 28, 2018

Room 354, City-County Building

Madison, WI

Debriefing Report

September 21, 2018

Anne Murphy-Lom, Lead Auditor

Jon Becker, Auditor

David Diamondstone, Auditor

Jeanne Thieme, Auditor

Daina, Zemliauskas, Auditor

Overall, the August 28th Post-Election Audit went very well. The two wards randomly selected for audit include:

- City of Madison, Ward 44
- City of Middleton, Wards 5-8

Auditors Anne Murphy-Lom (Lead) and Jon Becker served as ballot couriers on Monday, August 27, 2018 to collect ballots from the of Clerks Office for the City of Middleton, maintaining the chain of custody at all times, and transported them to the Dane County Clerk's Office. Anne Murphy-Lom and Jon Becker served as ballot couriers to collect ballots from City of Madison directly from the City of Madison's election storage location on East Washington Avenue on Tuesday, August 28, 2018, maintaining chain of custody at all times, transporting them to the Dane County Clerk's Office.

Auditors Anne Murphy-Lom (Lead), Jon Becker, David Diamondstone, Jane Thieme, and Daina Zemliauskas went to Room 354, City-County Building, Madison, WI on Tuesday, August 28, 2018 to conduct an audit of paper ballots for City of Madison, Ward 44 and City of Middleton, Wards 5-8 from the August 14, 2018 partisan primary.

Audit Timeline:

Audit Preparation Timeline (Lead Auditor):

7:45 am – 8:30 am 8/2/18: August 14 post-election Audit scheduling/logistics

7:30 am - 8:30 am 8/19/18: Review and revision of audit paperwork

8:00 am – 8:30 am 8/20/18: August 14 post-election audit scheduling and logistics/selection of wards

2:45 pm – 3:15 pm 8/22/18: August 14 post-election audit scheduling/logistics

8:30 am – 10:00 am 8/27/18: Ballot transport from City of Middleton prior to audit

7:00 pm – 9:00 pm 8/27/18: Final audit preparations including revision and printing of materials

8:00 am – 3:15 pm 8/28/18: Pick up City of Madison, Ward 44 ballots. Conduct Post-Election Audit of 8/14/18 partisan primary

Audit Courier Timeline (verifying Chain of Custody)

August 27, 2018 – City of Middleton

8:30 am: Met Jon Becker at agreed upon location; drove together in Anne Murphy-Lom’s vehicle to the City of Middleton Clerk’s Office. Received ballot bags #96148 and #96147.

9:45 am: Ballots from the City of Middleton were delivered to the Dane County Clerk’s Office on August 27, 2018, maintaining chain of custody.

August 28, 2018 – City of Madison

7:55 am: Met Jon Becker at the City of Madison’s election storage unit on East Washington Avenue to pick up ballots from Ward 44. Received ballot bags #75309, #68114 and #74413; drove together in John Becker’s vehicle to the Dane County Clerk’s Office maintaining chain of custody.

8:30 am: Arrived at Dane County Clerk’s Office.

Audit Timeline (verifying Chain of Custody) August 28, 2018:

8:30 am: All Auditors met in lobby of City-County Building to discuss procedure and receive audit paperwork.

8:32 am: Auditors obtained chain-of-custody initials; received ballot bags, and location-specific polling place incident reports with location-specific County election night tabulator report tapes; all auditors maintained chain-of-custody during final transport of materials from County Clerk’s Office

to Room 354, City-County Building.

8:46 am: Auditors entered Room 354; upon entry to room, auditors publicly announced "*We are auditors with the Dane County Clerk's Office. Our purpose is to conduct a public meeting regarding a post-election audit of paper ballots of select Dane County polling locations from the August 14, 2018 partisan primary. The randomly selected wards are City of Madison, Ward 44 and City of Middleton, Wards 5-8.*"; Auditors unloaded audit materials and prepared audit room. Lead Auditor arrived verified room set-up/accessibility.

9:00 am: Lead Auditor made introductory remarks. Riley Willman and Bill Wirkus from the Wisconsin Election Commission arrived to observe audit. No press was in attendance throughout the audit. Observers left at approximately 11:00 am.

9:00 am: Lead Auditor assigned Auditors Jane Thieme and Daina Zemliauskas to audit City of Middleton, Wards 5-8; assigned Auditors Jon Becker and David Diamondstone to audit City of Madison, Ward 44.

9:05 am: Audit commenced:

- Auditors of City of Middleton: Ballot Bags #96147 and #96148 were opened, separated by party preference and tallied.
- Auditors of City of Madison: Ballot Bags #68114 and #74413 were opened, separated by party preference and tallied. Ballot bag #75309 was not opened as it included only unused ballots.

9:09 am: Observers officially registered with Lead Auditor.

11:30 am: Auditors from the City of Middleton had one ballot who chose party preference for the Democratic Party, but marked and crossed out candidates in the Republican Party. Then the voter selected candidates in the Democratic Party. Auditors tallied it as the selected Democratic candidate.

12:10 pm: Auditors had a ballot with a write-in that was not registered as a write-in. Marked as a write-in on the tally sheet assuming the machine had tallied it as such in the final count.

2:15 pm: Auditors of City of Madison, Ward 44 completed final bag tally, arriving at totals which matched the election night tape totals (925 total votes). Auditors reviewed and reconciled tally sheets.

2:35 pm: Auditors of City of Middleton, Wards 5-8 completed final bag tally, arriving at totals which matched the election night tape totals (1247 total votes). Auditors reviewed and reconciled tally sheets.

2:40 pm: Auditors of City of Madison, Ward 44 resealed ballots in new ballot bags.

- New Ballot Bag Seal #80304 and #80305 (contains contents of ballot bag seal #68114 and #74113). Ballot bag #75309 was not opened as it contained only unused ballots.

2:45 pm: Auditors of City of Middleton, Wards 5-8 resealed ballots in new ballot bags.

- New Ballot Bag Seal #80306 and #80307 (contains contents of ballot bag seal #96147 and #96148)

2:45 pm: Auditors completed and verified paperwork:

- Ballot bags were signed by all Auditors and seal numbers were added to Polling Location Inspectors' Statements as well as Audit Inspectors' Statements.
- Lead auditor reviewed Audit Tally Sheets and Audit Inspectors' Statements. All auditors reviewed Audit Inspectors' Statements.
- Auditors gathered all paperwork and ballots; all auditors transferred audit materials to Dane County Clerk's Office (maintaining chain of custody). Auditors left the room at 2:56 pm.

3:03 pm: Dane County Clerk received all paperwork and ballots. Ballots were secured in Dane County Clerk's Office.

3:05 pm: Audit complete. Auditors left City-County Building.

Results of Post-Election Audit - August 28, 2018

City of Madison, Ward 44

Democratic Candidate for Governor

Post-Election Audit Results: (925 total ballots)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Andy Gronik	0
Matt Flynn	14
Tony Evers	270
Josh Pade	2
Mike McCabe	126
Mahlon Mitchell	94
Kelda Helen Roys	224
Paul R. Soglin	63
Kathleen Vinehout	93
Dana Wachs	0
Write-In	0
Other Parties	37
*Undetermined	0
Blank	2

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (925 total ballots)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Andy Gronik	0
Matt Flynn	14
Tony Evers	270
Josh Pade	2
Mike McCabe	126
Mahlon Mitchell	94
Kelda Helen Roys	224
Paul R. Soglin	63
Kathleen Vinehout	93
Dana Wachs	0
Write-in	0
Other Parties	37
*Undetermined	0
Blank	2

Results of Post-Election Audit – August 28, 2018

City of Middleton, Wards 5-8

Democratic Candidate for Governor

Post-Election Audit Results: (1247 total ballots)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Andy Gronik	4
Matt Flynn	20
Tony Evers	415
Josh Pade	1
Mike McCabe	123
Mahlon Mitchell	95
Kelda Helen Roys	188
Paul R. Soglin	78
Kathleen Vinehout	152
Dana Wachs	1
Write-In	1
Other Parties	162
*Undetermined	0
Blank	7

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (1247 total ballots)

Candidate	Tally
Andy Gronik	4
Matt Flynn	20
Tony Evers	415
Josh Pade	1
Mike McCabe	123
Mahlon Mitchell	95
Kelda Helen Roys	188
Paul R. Soglin	78
Kathleen Vinehout	152
Dana Wachs	1
Write-in	1
Other Parties	162
*Undetermined	0
BLANK	7

Observations

The August 28, 2018 audit of paper ballots took significantly more time than earlier audits due to high turnout and having to determine party preference before determining the intent of the voter. The audit took about 6 hours from start to finish. Even though it took more time, two auditors were able to conduct the audit efficiently. Also, only auditing the Democratic candidates for Governor made the tally sheets easy to use.

In order to conduct a more efficient audit, the auditors first separated the ballots by party preference prior to counting the total number of ballots. Separating them by the marked preference allowed the auditors to ignore any marks in other races on the ballot and only focus on the candidate name. Ballots which did not have a marked preference took more time to determine how the tabulator would read the ballot and whether the intent of the voter was clear. I would recommend that the ballots are separated by party preference prior completing the tally for upcoming partisan primaries.

The auditors are continuing to use audit tally sheet based off one created and distributed by the WEC. All auditors agreed that these tally sheet was easier to keep track of the overall count and to reconcile numbers throughout the process. The auditors are now keeping track of undetermined and blank ballots separately so reconciliation of numbers is easier. Separating them helped accurately track the primary votes.

City of Madison, Ward 44

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 44 equaled the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 44.
- The total votes counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 44 in the Democratic Candidate for Governor race equaled the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 44.
- All candidate vote totals counted by auditors in City of Madison Ward 44 in the Democratic Candidate for Governor equaled the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 44.

City of Middleton, Wards 5-8

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in the City of Middleton, Wards 5-8 equaled the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from the City of Middleton, Wards 5-8.
- The total votes counted by auditors in City of Middleton, Wards 5-8 in the Democratic Candidate for Governor equaled the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Middleton, Wards 5-8.
- All candidate vote totals counted by auditors in the City of Middleton in the Democratic Candidate for Governor equaled the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Middleton, Wards 5-8.

Recommendation: Partisan primaries are more complex than other elections. Auditors regularly noticed that even though a party preference was identified, voters chose candidates in other parties as well, sometimes voting for several candidates in different parties for a single office. As the party preference was selected, the auditors were able to determine what vote the tabulator recorded. More education is needed to make sure a voter understands what it means to vote in a partisan primary and they are able to clearly articulate their intent onto a ballot.

Creatively Marked Ballots

There were very few instances of ballots which intent could be determined but were marked in a way which in another instance might not have been detected by the tabulator. Instances included:

- Ballots marked in pencil
- Lines through circle, rather than filled-in
- Circles that were crossed out, rather than filled in.
- Write-in candidates who were not registered with the Clerk's Office.

Recommendation: Voter outreach seems to be correcting most of these issues. We should continue voter education outreach at the polling place, emphasizing the best practice **to completely fill in the oval** to indicate voter intent on the ballot. More voter education may be needed to better explain how a partisan primary works and that voters can only select candidates in one party.

Action Plan:

- Lead Auditor should continue to refine audit procedures reflecting recommendations and best practices and continue to follow changes as they occur. Specific procedures for partisan primaries may need to be developed.

Addendum:

- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), City of Madison, Ward 44, August 28, 2018 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), City of Middleton, Wards 5-8, August 28, 2018 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), City of Madison, Ward 44, August 28, 2018 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), City of Middleton, Wards 5-8, August 28, 2018 Audit
- August 28, 2018 Post-Election Audit Staff Timesheet