
Post-Election Audit of the November 6, 2018 Election

Audit Date:

November 27, 2018

Room 357, City County Building
Madison, WI

Lead Auditor:

Anne Murphy-Lom

Auditors:

David Diamondstone

Rudy Moore

Jeanne Thieme

Daina Zemliauskas

Overall, the November 27, 2018 Post-Election Audit went well. The two wards randomly selected for the audit include:

- City of Madison, Ward 35
- Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4

Auditors Anne Murphy-Lom (Lead) and David Diamondstone served as ballot couriers on Monday, November 26, 2018 to collect ballots from the of Clerk's Office for the Town of Pleasant Springs, maintaining the chain of custody at all times, and transport them to the Dane County Clerk's Office. The City of Madison Clerk's Office transported ballots from Ward 35 directly to the Dane County Clerk's Office, maintaining chain of custody on Wednesday, November 21, 2018.

Auditors Anne Murphy-Lom (Lead), David Diamondstone, Rudy Moore, Jeane Thieme, and Daina Zemliauskas went to Room 357, City-County Building, Madison, WI on Tuesday, November 27, 2018 to conduct an audit of paper ballots for City of Madison, Ward 35 and Town of Pleasant Springs, Ward 1-4 from the November 6, 2018 election.

Audit Preparation Timeline (Lead Auditor)

- 12:30 pm – 1:00 pm 10/26/18** November 6 Post Election Audit scheduling/logistics
- 10:30 am – 10:45 am 11/7/18** November 6 Post Election Audit rescheduling/logistics
- 5:00 pm - 5:30 pm 11/14/18** November 6 Post Election Audit scheduling/logistics/selection of wards
- 5:30 pm – 5:45 pm 11/15/18** November 6 Post Election Audit logistics
- 12:15 pm – 12:45 pm 11/20/18** November 6 Post Election Audit Scheduling/logistics
- 8:30 pm – 10:00 pm 11/25/18** Final audit preparations including revision and printing of materials
- 9:30 am – 11:15 am 11/26/18** Ballot transport from Town of Pleasant Springs prior to audit
- 8:00 pm – 9:15 pm 11/26/18** Final audit preparations including revision and printing of materials
- 8:30 am – 2:30 pm 11/27/18** Conduct Post-Election Audit of 11/6/18 election

Audit Courier Timeline (verifying Chain of Custody)

November 21, 2018 – City of Madison

Ballots from the City of Madison were delivered to the Dane County Clerk's Office on November 21, 2018, maintaining chain of custody.

November 26, 2018 – Town of Pleasant Springs

9:30 am: Met David Diamondstone at agreed upon location; drove together in Anne Murphy-Lom's vehicle to Town of Pleasant Springs's Clerk's Office.

9:55 am: Arrived at Town of Pleasant Springs Clerk's Office.

10:05 am: Received 3 ballot bags (seal numbers 104570, 104568 and 104569) and signed chain of custody report. Drove ballots to City-County Building together in Anne Murphy-Lom's vehicle with David Diamondstone, maintaining chain of custody.

10:55 am: Arrived at City-County Building; Anne Murphy-Lom and David Diamondstone transferred 3 ballot bags (seal numbers 104570, 104568 and 104569) to Dane County Clerk's office, maintaining chain of custody.

Audit Timeline (verifying Chain of Custody) on November 27, 2018

8:35 am: Lead Auditor arrived at City-County Building to verify room set-up and accessibility.

8:45 am: All Auditors met in lobby of City-County Building to discuss procedure and receive audit paperwork.

8:53 am: Auditors obtained chain-of-custody initials; received ballot bags, location-specific polling place incident reports, and election night tabulator report tapes for the County Clerk; auditors maintained chain-of-custody during final transport of materials from County Clerk's Office to Room 357, City-County Building.

8:57 am: Auditors entered Room 357; upon entry to room, auditors publicly announced *"We are auditors with the Dane County Clerk's Office. Our purpose is to conduct a public meeting regarding a post-election audit of paper ballots of select Dane County polling locations from the November 6, 2018 election. The randomly selected wards are City of Madison, Ward 35 and Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4."* Auditors unloaded audit materials and prepared audit room.

9:00 am: Lead Auditor made introductory remarks. There were no observers or press in attendance throughout the audit.

9:05 am: Lead Auditor assigned Auditors Jeanne Thieme and Daina Zemliauskas to audit City of Madison, Ward 35; assigned Auditors David Diamondstone and Rudy Moore to audit Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4.

9:06 am: Audit commenced:

- Auditors of Town of Pleasant Springs: Ballot Bags #104568, #104569, and #104570 were opened and tallied.
- Auditors of City of Madison: Ballot Bags #68115 and #80244 were opened and tallied. Ballot bags #80705 and #80687 were determined to include unused ballots and were not opened. Ballots from Ward 36 were also removed.

10:33 am: Ballot had marks in the area of both Walker and Evers. Auditors determined that the intent was clearly Evers but was not sure if the machine would count it as an overvote. Counted as Evers in the audit tally.

10:40 am: Write-in on a ballot for the City of Madison were not registered as an eligible write-in.

11:06 am: Overvote on ballot in Town of Pleasant Springs. Could not determine intent. Counted as undetermined on tally sheet.

11:18 am: Ballot in the Town of Pleasant Springs was marked for Evers, but voter also had written in Mandela Barnes for Governor. Tallied as Evers as the write-in circle was not filled in.

11:28 am: Possible overvote for City of Madison, Ward 35. Auditors determined intent was for Walker, but voter made a small mark in the bubble for Evers. Tallied vote as vote for Walker.

12:03 pm: Auditors of City of Madison, Ward 35 completed the final bag tally. Determined that the vote for Walker (11:28 am) in the audit tally was counted as an overvote by the tabulator. Walker (audit tally) total: 128; Walker total: (tape) 127. Overvote (audit tally) total: 0; Overvote (tape) total: 1. Auditors reviewed and reconciled tally sheets.

12:03 pm: There were 2 more ballots recorded by tabulator than voter slips for City of Madison, Ward 35. Per the original Inspectors' Statement, there was one new registration who did not receive a voter slip and another voter who received a ballot for Ward 35 but should have received a ballot for Ward 36. This resolved the discrepancy.

12:34 pm: Auditors for the City of Madison, Ward 35 resealed ballots in new ballot bags.

- New ballot bags seal #80332 and #80308 (contains contents of ballot bags seal #68115 and #80244)

12:45 pm: Reassigned Jeanne Thieme and Daina Zemliauskas to assist with Town of Pleasant Springs as the audit of the City of Madison ballots was complete.

1:56 pm: Auditors of Town of Pleasant Springs, 1-4 completed final bag tally. Auditors determined that one vote was intended for Evers but tabulator counted it as an overvote. Evers (audit tally) total: 1168; Evers (tape) 1167; Overvote (audit tally): 0; Overvote (tape)total: 1.

1:58 pm: There were 2 more ballots recorded by tabulator than voter slips handed out in the Town of Pleasant Springs. No reason was recorded on the Inspectors' Statement for the discrepancy.

2:05 pm: Auditors of Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4 resealed ballots in new ballot bags.

- New Ballot Bags Seal #1288 and #79268 (contains contents of ballot bag seal #104568, #104569 and #104570)

2:05 pm: Auditors completed and verified paperwork:

- Ballot bags were signed by Auditors and seal numbers were added to Polling Location Inspectors Statements as well as Audit Inspectors' Statements.
- Lead auditor reviewed Audit Tally Sheets and Audit Inspectors' Statements. All auditors reviewed Audit Inspectors' Statements.
- Auditors gathered all paperwork and ballots; all auditors transferred audit materials to Dane County Clerk's Office (maintaining chain of custody). Auditors left the room at 2:11 pm.

2:15 pm: Dane County Clerk received all paperwork and ballots. Ballots were secured in Dane County Clerk's Office.

2:30 pm: Audit complete. Auditors left City-County Building.

Results of Post-Election Audit

City of Madison, Ward 35

Office of the Governor/Lieutenant Governor

Post Election Audit Results: (926 total votes)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Scott Walker/Rebecca Kleefisch	128
Tony Evers/Mandela Barnes	775
Phillip Anderson/Patrick Baird	6
Michael J. White/Tiffany Anderson	1
Maggie Turnbull/Wil Losch	7
Arnie Enz/No Candidate	2
Write-In	1
*Undetermined	0
Blank	6

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (926 total votes)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Scott Walker/Rebecca Kleefisch	127
Tony Evers/Mandela Barnes	775
Phillip Anderson/Patrick Baird	6
Michael J. White/Tiffany Anderson	1
Maggie Turnbull/Wil Losch	7
Arnie Enz/No Candidate	2
Write-in	1
*Undetermined	1
Blank	6

Results of Post-Election Audit

Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4

Office of the Governor/Lieutenant Governor

Post-Election Audit Results: (1968 total ballots)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Scott Walker/Rebecca Kleefisch	769
Tony Evers/Mandela Barnes	1168
Phillip Anderson/Patrick Baird	11
Michael J. White/Tiffany Anderson	4
Maggie Turnbull/Wil Losch	7
Arnie Enz/No Candidate	3
Write-In	0
*Undetermined	1
Blank	5

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (1968 total ballots)

Candidate	Tally
Scott Walker/Rebecca Kleefisch	769
Tony Evers/Mandela Barnes	1167
Phillip Anderson/Patrick Baird	11
Michael J. White/Tiffany Anderson	4
Maggie Turnbull/Wil Losch	7
Arnie Enz/No Candidate	3
Write-in	0
*Undetermined	2
Blank	5

Observations

The November 27, 2018 audit of paper ballots took more time to count than earlier audits due to a very high turnout election. The audit took about 5.5 hours from start to finish. Two auditors were able to conduct the audit of a ward efficiently, but we did reassign auditors as the Town of Pleasant Springs had close to 2000 ballots.

The auditors are continuing to use audit tally sheet based off one created and distributed by the WEC. All auditors agreed that the tally sheets make it easy to keep track of the overall count and to reconcile discrepancies throughout the process. The auditors are now keeping track of undetermined and blank ballots separately as well, which also makes the tally easier to reconcile.

City of Madison, Ward 35

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 35 equaled the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 35.
- The total votes counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 35 in the Office of the Governor/Lieutenant Governor race equaled the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 35.
- Vote totals counted by auditors in City of Madison Ward 35 in the Office of the Governor/Lieutenant Governor race did not equal the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 35. During the audit, one additional vote intended for Scott Walker/Rebecca Kleefisch was counted by the tabulator as an overvote.

Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in the Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4 in the Office of the Governor/Lieutenant Governor race equaled the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from the Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4.
- The total votes counted by auditors in Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4 in the Office of the Governor/Lieutenant Governor's race equaled the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4.
- Vote totals counted by auditors in the Town of Pleasant Springs in the Office of the Governor/Lieutenant Governor race did not equal the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4. During the audit, one additional vote for Tony Evers/Mandela Barnes was counted by the tabulator as an overvote.

Recommendation: The auditors would like to remind election officials to document all discrepancies and other issues throughout election day. Both wards handed out more ballots than voter slips, and these types of issues need to be clearly explained on the Inspectors' Statement.

Creatively Marked Ballots

There were some instances of ballots which intent could be determined but were marked in a way which in another instance might not have been detected by the tabulator. Instances included:

- Ballots marked in pencil
- Lines through circle, rather than filled-in
- Marks (even small ones) in more than one circle, which causes an overvote.
- Including a write-in as well as voting for another candidate.

Recommendation: Voter outreach could correct these issues. Continue voter education outreach at the polling place, emphasizing the best practice **to completely fill in the oval** to indicate voter intent on the ballot. Clerks should also emphasize the importance of an election official monitoring the tabulator so that an and can immediately assist a voter if the tabulator identifies an overvote.

Action Plan:

- Lead Auditor will continue to refine audit procedures reflecting recommendations and best practices and continue to follow changes as they occur.

Addendum:

- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), City of Madison, Ward 35, November 27, 2018 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4, November 27, 2018 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), City of Madison, Ward 35, November 27, 2018 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), Town of Pleasant Springs, Wards 1-4, November 27, 2018 Audit