
Post-Election Audit of the February 18, 2020 Election

Audit Date:

March 2, 2020

Room 321, City County Building

Madison, WI

Lead Auditor:

Anne Murphy-Lom

Auditors:

David Diamondstone

Anne Habel

Jeanne Thieme

Daina Zemliauskas

Overall, the March 2, 2020 Post-Election Audit went well. The two wards randomly selected for the audits include:

- City of Madison, Ward 55
- Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4

Lead Auditor, Anne Murphy-Lom, served as the ballot courier on Wednesday, February 26, 2020 to collect the sealed ballot bags from the of Clerk's Office for the Town of Cross Plains, maintaining chain of custody and transported them to the Dane County Clerk's Office. Lead Auditor, Anne Murphy-Lom, met a representative for the City of Madison Clerk's Office at their tabulator storage location to retrieve the sealed ballot bags for Ward 55 on March 2, 2020, and transported the ballot bags to the Dane County Clerk's Office, maintaining chain of custody.

Auditors Anne Murphy-Lom, David Diamondstone, Anne Habel, Jeanne Thieme, and Daina Zemliauskas went to Room 321, City-County Building, Madison, WI on Monday, March 2, 2020 to conduct an audit of paper ballots for City of Madison, Ward 55 and the Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4 from the February 18, 2020 election.

Audit Preparation Timeline (Lead Auditor)

- | | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| 12:30 pm – 1:00 pm 2/5/20 | February 18 Post Election Audit scheduling/logistics |
| 8:00 am – 8:45 am 2/21/20 | February 18 Post Election Audit scheduling/logistics/selection of wards |
| 4:30 pm – 6:15 pm 2/26/20 | Ballot transport from Town of Cross Plains Clerk's Office |
| 4:30 pm – 5:00 pm 2/27/20 | February 18 Post Election Audit scheduling/logistics |
| 11:00 am – 1:30 pm 3/1/20 | Final audit preparations including revision and printing of materials |
| 8:15 am – 9:15 am 3/2/20 | Ballot transport from City of Madison's tabulator storage facility |
| 9:15 am – 12:30 pm 3/2/20 | Conduct Post-Election Audit of February 18 election |

Audit Courier Timeline (verifying Chain of Custody)

Wednesday, February 26, 2020 – Town of Cross Plains

4:30 pm: Lead Auditor, Anne Murphy-Lom, drove in her own vehicle to Town of Cross Plains Clerk's Office.

5:20 pm: Arrived at Town of Cross Plains Clerk's Office. Received 1 ballot bag (seal number 50333320) and signed chain of custody report. Drove ballots to City-County Building, maintaining chain of custody.

Approx 6:00 pm: Arrived at City-County Building; Anne Murphy-Lom transferred 1 ballot bag (seal number 50333320) to Dane County Clerk's office.

Monday, March 2, 2020 – City of Madison

8:15 am: Lead Auditor, Anne Murphy-Lom drove to City of Madison tabulator storage facility ballots to receive ballot bags.

8:36 am: Received 1 ballot bag (seal number 000079477) and signed chain of custody report. Drove ballots to the City County Building, maintaining chain of custody.

9:00 am: Arrived at City-County Building; Anne Murphy-Lom transferred 1 ballot bag (seal number 00079477) to the Dane County Clerk's office.

Audit Timeline (verifying Chain of Custody) on March 2, 2020

9:00 am: Lead Auditor arrived at City-County Building to verify room set-up and accessibility.

9:30 am: All Auditors met in lobby of City-County Building to discuss procedures and receive audit paperwork.

9:32 am: Auditors obtained chain-of-custody initials; received ballot bags, location-specific polling place incident reports, and election night tabulator report tapes for the County Clerk; auditors maintained chain of custody during final transport of materials from County Clerk's Office to Room 321, City-County Building.

9:42 am: Auditors entered Room 321; upon entry to room, auditors publicly announced "*We are auditors with the Dane County Clerk's Office. Our purpose is to conduct a public meeting regarding a post-election audit of paper ballots of select Dane County polling locations from the February 18, 2020 election. The randomly selected wards are City of Madison, Ward 55 and Town of Cross Plains, Ward 1-4.*" Auditors unloaded audit materials and prepared audit room.

9:55 am: Lead Auditor assigned Auditors Jeanne Thieme and Daina Zemliauskas to audit City of Madison, Ward 55; assigned Auditors David Diamondstone and Anne Habel to audit Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4.

10:00 am: Lead Auditor made introductory remarks. There were no observers or press in attendance throughout the audit.

10:05 am: Audit commenced:

- Auditors of Town of Cross Plains: Ballot bag #50333320 were opened and tallied.
- Auditors of City of Madison, Ward 55: Ballot bag #00079477 was opened and tallied.

11:15 am: Auditors for the City of Madison, Ward 55 completed the audit tally. Auditors reviewed and reconciled tally sheets. The number of votes matched the number on the results provided by the County Clerk's Office.

11:29 am: Auditors for the City of Madison, Ward 55 resealed ballots in new ballot bag.

- New ballot bag seal #00067722 (contains contents of ballot bag seal #00079477)

11:58 am: Auditors for the Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4 completed the audit tally. Auditors reviewed and reconciled tally sheets. The number of votes matched the number on the results provided by the County Clerk's Office.

12:09 pm: Auditors for the Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4 resealed ballots in new ballot bag.

- New ballot bag seal #00080335 (contains contents of ballot bag seal #50333320)

12:12 pm: Auditors left audit room.

12:17 pm Dane County Clerk received all paperwork and ballots. Ballots were secured in Dane County Clerk's Office.

12:30 pm: Audit complete. Auditors left City-County Building.

Results of Post-Election Audit

City of Madison, Ward 55

Justice of the Supreme Court

Post Election Audit Results: (369 total votes)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Daniel Kelly	48
Jill J. Karofsky	254
Ed Fallone	65
Write-In	1
*Undetermined	0
Blank	1

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (369 total votes)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Daniel Kelly	48
Jill J. Karofsky	254
Ed Fallone	65
Write-in	1
*Undetermined	0
Blank	1

Results of Post-Election Audit

Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4

Justice of the Supreme Court

Post-Election Audit Results: (311 total ballots)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Daniel Kelly	121
Jill J. Karofsky	136
Ed Fallone	52
Write-In	0
*Undetermined	2
Blank	0

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (311 total ballots)

Candidate	Tally
Daniel Kelly	121
Jill J. Karofsky	136
Ed Fallone	52
Write-in	0
*Undetermined	2
Blank	0

Observations

The March 2, 2020 audit of paper ballots only took about 2.5 hours, which was expected with a low turnout election. Two auditors were able to conduct the audit of each ward efficiently.

The auditors are continuing to use audit tally sheets based off one created and distributed by the WEC. All auditors agreed that the tally sheets make it easy to keep track of the overall count and to reconcile discrepancies throughout the process. The auditors are now keeping track of undetermined and blank ballots separately as well, which also makes the tally easier to reconcile.

The auditors would like to thank chief inspectors and their teams who continue to provide good information on the Inspector's Statement. The documentation on those statements make it much easier for the auditors to reconcile numbers and understand discrepancies.

City of Madison, Ward 55

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 55 equaled the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 55.
- The total votes counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 55 for the Justice of the Supreme Court equaled the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 55.
- Vote totals counted by auditors in City of Madison Ward 55 for the Justice of the Supreme Court equaled the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 55.

Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4 equaled the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4.
- The total votes counted by auditors in Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4 for the Justice of the Supreme Court equaled the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4.
- Vote totals counted by auditors in Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4 for the Justice of Supreme Court equaled the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4.

Recommendation: For one of the wards, ballots had to be counted multiple times because there were more ballots in the ballot bag than the tabulator had recorded. After reviewing ballots, it was determined that there were unvoted ballots (no initials and therefore not live ballots) in the same bag as voted ballots, causing the overall ballot count to be off. Once the unvoted ballots were removed, the ballot count was correct. Although it will only matter in an audit or a recount, we recommend the unvoted ballots are sealed in a separate ballot bag or separated in the ballot bag in some way to avoid this issue in the future.

Creatively Marked Ballots

There were some instances of ballots which intent could be determined but were marked in a way which in another instance might not have been detected by the tabulator. Instances included:

- Lines through circle, rather than filled-in
- Marks (even small ones) in more than one circle, which causes an overvote.
- Including a write-in as well as voting for another candidate or not filling in the write in circle.

Recommendation: Voter outreach could correct these issues. Continue voter education outreach at the polling place, emphasizing the best practice **to completely fill in the oval** to indicate voter intent on the ballot. Clerks should also emphasize the importance of an election official monitoring the tabulator so that an and can immediately assist a voter if the tabulator identifies an overvote.

Action Plan:

- Lead Auditor will continue to refine audit procedures reflecting recommendations and best practices and continue to follow changes as they occur.

Addendum:

- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), City of Madison, Ward 55, March 2, 2020 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4, March 2, 2020 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), City of Madison, Ward 55, March 2, 2020 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), Town of Cross Plains, Wards 1-4, March 2, 2020