
Post-Election Audit of the February 19, 2019 and April 2, 2109 Elections

Audit Date:

April 16, 2019

Room 354, City County Building

Madison, WI

Lead Auditor:

Anne Murphy-Lom

Auditors:

David Diamondstone

Jeanne Thieme

Daina Zemliauskas

Overall, the April 16, 2019 Post-Election Audit went well. The Dane County Clerk's Office and the Lead Auditor agreed to hold the audits for February 19, 2019 and the April 2, 2019 elections at the same time due to the short time span between the primary and spring elections.

The two wards randomly selected for the audits include:

From the Spring Primary on February 19, 2019

- City of Madison, Ward 95
- City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20

From the April Election on April 2, 2019

- City of Madison, Ward 58
- Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2

Auditors Anne Murphy-Lom (Lead) and Chad Lom served as ballot couriers on Thursday, March 28, 2019 to collect ballots from the of Clerk's Office for the City of Fitchburg, maintaining chain of custody and transported them to the Dane County Clerk's Office. The City of Madison Clerk's Office transported ballots from Ward 95 directly to the Dane County Clerk's Office, maintaining chain of custody on Wednesday, March 27, 2019.

Lead Auditor Anne Murphy-Lom served as the ballot courier on Monday, April 15, 2019 to collect ballots from the City of Sun Prairie Clerk's Office as arranged by the Town of Deerfield, maintaining chain of custody and transported them to the Clerk's Office. The City of Madison Clerk's Office transported ballots on Ward 58 directly to the Dane County Clerk's Office, maintaining chain of custody on Wednesday, April 10, 2019.

Auditors Anne Murphy-Lom (Lead), David Diamondstone, Jeane Thieme, and Daina Zemliauskas (one auditor did not report that day) went to Room 354, City-County Building, Madison, WI on Tuesday, April 16, 2019 to conduct an audit of paper ballots for City of Madison, Ward 95 and 58, the City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20 and the Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2 from the February 19, 2019 and April 2, 2019 elections.

Audit Preparation Timeline (Lead Auditor)

- 9:15 am – 10:15 am 3/15/19** February 19 and April 2 Post Election Audit scheduling/logistics
- 12:15 pm – 12:45 pm 3/25/19** February 19 and April 2 Post Election Audit scheduling/logistics
- 8:00 am – 9:00 am 3/28/19** Ballot transport from City of Fitchburg to Clerk's Office
- 7:45 am – 8:45 am 4/11/19** February 19 and April 2 Post Election Audit scheduling/logistics
- 6:00 pm – 7:00 pm 4/14/19** Final audit preparations including revision and printing of materials
- 3:00 pm – 4:45 pm 4/15/19** Ballot transport from City of Sun Prairie to Clerk's Office
- 6:00 pm – 8:45 pm 4/15/19** Final audit preparations including revision and printing of materials
- 8:15 am – 1:45 pm 4/16/19** Conduct Post-Election Audit of February 19 and April 2 elections

Audit Courier Timeline (verifying Chain of Custody)

Wednesday, March 27, 2019 – City of Madison

Ballots from the City of Madison were delivered to the Dane County Clerk's Office maintaining chain of custody.

Thursday, March 28, 2019 – City of Fitchburg

8:00 am: Drove together with Chad Lom in Anne Murphy-Lom's vehicle to City of Fitchburg Clerk's Office.

8:20 am: Arrived at City of Fitchburg Clerk's Office.

Approx 8:25 am: Received 1 ballot bag (seal number 00104650) and signed chain of custody report. Drove ballots to City-County Building together in Anne Murphy-Lom's vehicle, maintaining chain of custody.

Approx 9:50 am: Arrived at City-County Building; Anne Murphy-Lom and Chad Lom transferred 1 ballot bag (seal number 00104650) to Dane County Clerk's office.

Wednesday, April 10, 2019 – City of Madison

Ballots from the City of Madison were delivered to the Dane County Clerk's Office maintaining chain of custody.

Monday, April 15, 2019 – Town of Deerfield

3:00 pm: Lead Auditor, Anne Murphy-Lom drove to City of Sun Prairie Clerk's Office to pick up Town of Deerfield's ballots as agreed on by both clerks.

Approx 3:55 pm: Received 1 ballot bag (seal number 55450894) and signed chain of custody report. Drove ballots to the City County Building, maintaining chain of custody.

Approx 4:45 pm: Arrived at City-County Building; Anne Murphy-Lom transferred 1 ballot bag (seal number 55450894) to the Dane County Clerk's office.

Audit Timeline (verifying Chain of Custody) on April 16, 2019

8:15 am: Lead Auditor arrived at City-County Building to verify room set-up and accessibility.

8:30 am: All Auditors met in lobby of City-County Building to discuss procedure and receive audit paperwork.

8:58 am: Auditors obtained chain-of-custody initials; received ballot bags, location-specific polling place incident reports, and election night tabulator report tapes for the County Clerk; auditors maintained chain of custody during final transport of materials from County Clerk's Office to Room 354, City-County Building.

9:00 am: Auditors entered Room 354; upon entry to room, auditors publicly announced *"We are auditors with the Dane County Clerk's Office. Our purpose is to conduct a public meeting regarding a post-election audit of paper ballots of select Dane County polling locations from the February 19, 2019 and April 2, 2019 elections. The randomly selected wards are City of Madison, Ward 58 and 95 and City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20 and Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2."* Auditors unloaded audit materials and prepared audit room.

9:00 am: Lead Auditor made introductory remarks. There were no observers or press in attendance throughout the audit.

9:10 am: Lead Auditor assigned Auditors Jeanne Thieme and Daina Zemliauskas to audit City of Madison, Wards 58 and 95; assigned Auditors David Diamondstone and herself to audit City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20 and Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2. One auditor did not report.

9:18 am: Audit commenced:

- Auditors of City of Fitchburg: Ballot bag #104650 were opened and tallied. Auditors noted that an original ballot bag #104652 had been opened on 2/21/19 by City Clerk to reconcile absentees per original Inspector's Statement. The contents were then sealed in the new ballot bag #104650.
- Auditors of City of Madison, Ward 95: Ballot Bags #0079976 were opened and tallied. Ballot bag #119081 was determined to include unused ballots and were not opened. Ballots from Ward 96 were removed.
- When ballots for the City of Fitchburg were counted, there were 2 ballots less (569) than listed on the result tape (571). After consulting the original Inspector's Statement, the auditors found that in the incident log that 2 ballots were counted twice due to ballot jams. This reconciled the discrepancy, and the auditors moved forward with 569 ballots.

10:58 am: Auditors for the City of Madison, Ward 95 completed the audit tally. Auditors reviewed and reconciled tally sheets. The number of votes matched the number on the results provided by the County Clerk's Office.

11:27 am: Auditors for the City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20 completed the audit tally. The reported results for Ed Kinney reported 165 but the audit result was 163. As the original statement reported 2 ballot jams (see above) the auditors determined that those 2 ballots had both been reported for Kinney. Auditors reviewed and reconciled tally sheets.

11:45 am: Auditors for the City of Madison, Ward 95 resealed ballots in new ballot bag.

- New ballot bag seal #50019 (contains contents of ballot bag seal #79976)

11:53 am: Auditors for the City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20 resealed ballots in new ballot bag.

- New ballot bag seal #50018 (contains contents of ballot bag seal #104650)

11:51 am: Second audit commenced

- Auditors of City of Madison – Ward 58: Ballot bag #118500 was opened and tallied. Ballot bag #118501 was determined to include only blank ballots and was not opened.

- Auditors of Town of Deerfield: Ballot bag seal #55450894 was opened and tallied.

12:37 pm: Auditors finished completed final bag tally. Auditors reviewed and reconciled tally sheets. The number of votes matched the number on the results tape provided by the County Clerk's Office.

1:00 pm: Auditors for the City of Madison, Ward 58 resealed ballots in new ballot bag.

- New ballot bag seal # 79269 (contains contents of ballot bag seal #115800).

1:15 pm: Auditors for the Town of Deerfield completed the audit tally. Auditors reviewed and reconciled tally sheets. The number of votes matched the number on the results provided by the County Clerk's Office.

1:22 pm: Auditors for the Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2 resealed ballots in new ballot bag.

- New ballot bag deal #67719 (contains contents of ballot bag seal #55450894)

1:30 pm: Auditors left audit room.

1:38 pm Dane County Clerk received all paperwork and ballots. Ballots were secured in Dane County Clerk's Office.

1:45 pm: Audit complete. Auditors left City-County Building.

Results of Post-Election Audit

City of Madison, Ward 95

City of Madison Mayor

Post Election Audit Results: (469 total votes)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Satya Rhodes-Conway	96
Paul R. Soglin	172
Nick Hart	6
Raj Shukla	72
Mo Cheeks	118
Write-In	3
*Undetermined	0
Blank	2

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (469 total votes)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Satya Rhodes-Conway	96
Paul R. Soglin	172
Nick Hart	6
Raj Shukla	72
Mo Cheeks	118
Write-in	3
*Undetermined	0
Blank	2

Results of Post-Election Audit

City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20

Fitchburg Alderperson, District 4, Seat 8

Post-Election Audit Results: (569 total ballots)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Scott Lehmann	84
Janell Rice	223
Marc A. Jones	91
Ed Kinney	163
Write-In	1
*Undetermined	0
Blank	7

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (571 total ballots)

Candidate	Tally
Scott Lehmann	84
Janell Rice	223
Marc A. Jones	91
Ed Kinney	165
Write-in	1
*Undetermined	0
Blank	7

Results of Post-Election Audit

City of Madison, Ward 58

Justice of the Supreme Court

Post-Election Audit Results: (273 total ballots)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Brian Hagedorn	32
Lisa Neubauer	237
Write-In	0
*Undetermined	0
Blank	4

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (273 total ballots)

Candidate	Tally
Brian Hagedorn	32
Lisa Neubauer	237
Write-in	0
*Undetermined	0
Blank	4

Results of Post-Election Audit

Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2

Justice of the Supreme Court

Post-Election Audit Results: (403 total ballots)

Candidate	Vote Tally
Brian Hagedorn	147
Lisa Neubauer	245
Write-In	1
*Undetermined	0
Blank	10

*Undetermined: ballots which the auditors could not determine intent

Publicly Reported Results provided by County Clerk: (403 total ballots)

Candidate	Tally
Brian Hagedorn	147
Lisa Neubauer	245
Write-in	1
*Undetermined	0
Blank	10

Observations

The April 16, 2019 audit of paper ballots took more time to count as we did four audits instead of two. This was possible as the ballot counts for the selected wards were low, expected for low turnout elections. The audits took about 5.25 hours from start to finish. Two auditors were able to conduct the audit of each ward efficiently.

The auditors are continuing to use audit tally sheets based off one created and distributed by the WEC. All auditors agreed that the tally sheets make it easy to keep track of the overall count and to reconcile discrepancies throughout the process. The auditors are now keeping track of undetermined and blank ballots separately as well, which also makes the tally easier to reconcile.

The auditors would like to thank chief inspectors and their teams who continue to provide good information on the Inspector's Statement. The documentation on those statements make it much easier for the auditors to reconcile numbers and understand discrepancies.

City of Madison, Ward 95

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 95 equaled the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 95.
- The total votes counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 95 in the Office of the City of Madison Mayoral race equaled the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 95.
- Vote totals counted by auditors in City of Madison Ward 95 in the City of Madison Mayoral race equaled the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 95.

City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in the City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20 in the Office of Alderman District 4, Seat 8 race did not equal the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from the City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20. Due to ballot jams, there were 2 ballots which were counted twice.
- The total votes counted by auditors in City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20 in the Alderman District 4, Seat 8 race did not equal the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20. Due to ballot jams, 2 additional votes were counted.
- Vote totals counted by auditors in the City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20 in the Alderman District 4, Seat 8 race did not equal the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20. Due to ballot jams, 2 additional votes were counted for Ed Kinney.

City of Madison, Ward 58

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 58 equaled the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 58.
- The total votes counted by auditors in City of Madison, Ward 58 in the Justice of the Supreme Court race equaled the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 58.
- Vote totals counted by auditors in City of Madison Ward 58 in the Justice of Supreme Court race equaled the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from City of Madison, Ward 58.

Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2

- The total number of ballots counted by auditors in equaled the total number of ballots reported on the tabulator tape from election night from Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2.
- The total votes counted by auditors Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2 in the Justice of the Supreme Court race equaled the total number of votes reported on the tabulator tape from election night from Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2.
- Vote totals counted by auditors in Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2 in the Justice of the Supreme Court race equaled the candidate vote totals reported on the tabulator tape from election night from Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2.

Recommendation: The auditors would like to continue to remind to election officials to document all discrepancies and other issues throughout election day. The City of Fitchburg had good documentation on the ballot jam issues and that assisted the auditors with understanding what happened.

Creatively Marked Ballots

There were some instances of ballots which intent could be determined but were marked in a way which in another instance might not have been detected by the tabulator. Instances included:

- Ballots marked in pencil
- Lines through circle, rather than filled-in
- Marks (even small ones) in more than one circle, which causes an overvote.
- Including a write-in as well as voting for another candidate.

Recommendation: Voter outreach could correct these issues. Continue voter education outreach at the polling place, emphasizing the best practice **to completely fill in the oval** to indicate voter intent on the ballot.

Clerks should also emphasize the importance of an election official monitoring the tabulator so that an and can immediately assist a voter if the tabulator identifies an overvote.

Action Plan:

- Lead Auditor will continue to refine audit procedures reflecting recommendations and best practices and continue to follow changes as they occur.

Addendum:

- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), City of Madison, Ward 95, April 16, 2019 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), City of Fitchburg, Wards 15-20, April 16, 2019 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), City of Madison, Ward 58, April 16, 2019 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Tally Sheet (Template), Town of Deerfield, Wards 1-2, April 16, 2019 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), City of Madison, Ward 95, April 16, 2019 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), City of Fitchburg, Wards 1-4, April 16, 2019
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), City of Madison, Ward 58, April 16, 2019 Audit
- Post-Election Audit Inspectors Statement (Template), Town of Deerfield, Ward 1-4, April 16, 2019 Audit